



AGENDA
CUYAHOGA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT ADVISORY SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 31, 2024
CUYAHOGA COUNTY ADMINISTRATIVE HEADQUARTERS
COMMITTEE ROOM A – 4TH FLOOR
2:00 PM

- 1. CALL TO ORDER**
- 2. ROLL CALL**
- 3. PUBLIC COMMENT**
- 4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM OCTOBER 25, 2023 and DECEMBER 13, MEETINGS** [See Page 3]
- 5. MATTERS REFERRED TO COMMITTEE**
 - a) None
- 6. DISCUSSION**

Discussion on the Proposed Metrics/Goals (see attached) for Bank Performance to Address the Priority Needs to: [See Page 7]

- Increase and sustain homeownership for historically underserved communities and populations
- Increase home repair loans
- Encourage lenders to be entrepreneurial with assistance to non-profits and small business

7. MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS

8. ADJOURNMENT

**Complimentary parking for the public is available in the attached garage at 900 Prospect. A skywalk extends from the garage to provide additional entry to the Council Chambers from the 5th floor parking level of the garage. Please see the Clerk to obtain a complimentary parking pass.*

***Council Chambers is equipped with a hearing assistance system. If needed, please see the Clerk to obtain a receiver.*



MINUTES

**CUYAHOGA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT ADVISORY SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING
WEDNESDAY, OCTOBER 25, 2023
CUYAHOGA COUNTY ADMINISTRATIVE HEADQUARTERS
COMMITTEE ROOM A – 4TH FLOOR
2:00 PM**

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairwoman Stephens called the meeting to order at 2:03 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Ms. Stephens asked Assistant Deputy Clerk Georgakopoulos to call the roll. Subcommittee members Stephens, Anderson, Benjamin, Martin O'Toole, Seren and Zone were in attendance. A quorum was established. Subcommittee members Jones, Blackwell, Nowak and Welo were absent from the meeting. Ms. Blue Donald arrived after the roll call was taken. Mr. Frank Ford of Frank Ford Consulting, LLC was also in attendance.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments given.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM SEPTEMBER 27, 2023 MEETING

A motion was made by Mr. Seren, seconded by Mr. Benjamin, and approved by unanimous vote to approve the minutes from the September 27, 2023 meeting.

5. MATTERS REFERRED TO COMMITTEE

- a) Enhanced Scope of Work/Objectives of the Subcommittee to include:

- Increase and Sustain Home Ownership
- Home Repair Loans and Home Repair Assistance
- Working Capital for Non-Profits and Small Businesses

b) Decision to Pursue Specific Objectives

Mr. Ford addressed the subcommittee and reviewed the list of the enhanced scope of work/objectives. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Mr. Ford pertaining to the item, which he answered accordingly.

On a motion by Mr. Benjamin with a second by Mr. Zone, the item was considered and approved by unanimous vote.

6. DISCUSSION

- a) Review of Preliminary 2022 Lending Data – Frank Ford
- b) Update on Banking services Request for Proposals (RFP) Process – Treasurer’s Office

Mr. Ford and Ms. Lisa Rocco, Director of Operations for the Fiscal Office, addressed the subcommittee regarding the presentation on Preliminary Bank Lending Research Findings. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Mr. Ford and Ms. Rocco pertaining to the findings, which they answered accordingly.

Ms. Rocco addressed the subcommittee and provided an update on the banking services Request for Proposals process. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Ms. Rocco pertaining to the Request for Proposals, which she answered accordingly.

7. MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS

Mr. Zone recommended more community engagement through a listening tour to recognize the work of the subcommittee. Ms. Stephens asked Mr. Zone to forward related information to the clerk.

Ms. Stephens announced that the next meeting of the subcommittee is scheduled for November 15, 2023 at 2:00 p.m.

8. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, Chairwoman Stephens adjourned the meeting at 3:01 p.m., without objection.



MINUTES

CUYAHOGA COUNTY COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT
COMMUNITY REINVESTMENT ADVISORY SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING
WEDNESDAY, DECEMBER 13, 2023
CUYAHOGA COUNTY ADMINISTRATIVE HEADQUARTERS
COMMITTEE ROOM A – 4TH FLOOR
2:00 PM

1. CALL TO ORDER

Chairwoman Stephens called the meeting to order at 2:13 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Ms. Stephens asked Assistant Deputy Clerk Georgakopoulos to call the roll. Subcommittee members Stephens, Anderson and Blackwell were in attendance. A quorum was not established. Subcommittee members Jones, Blue Donald, Martin O’Toole, Nowak, Seren, Welo and Zone were absent from the meeting. Subcommittee member Benjamin arrived after the roll call was taken. Mr. Frank Ford of Frank Ford Consulting, LLC was also in attendance.

3. PUBLIC COMMENT

There were no public comments given.

4. APPROVAL OF MINUTES FROM OCTOBER 25, 2023 MEETING

Ms. Stephens indicated that the minutes from the October 25, 2023 meeting could not be voted on or approved, as a quorum was not established.

5. MATTERS REFERRED TO COMMITTEE

- a) None

6. DISCUSSION

- a) Banking Lending Research Update – Frank Ford

Mr. Frank Ford of Frank Ford Consulting, LLC, presented preliminary findings for 2022 Home Mortgage Lending to the subcommittee. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Mr. Ford, which he answered accordingly.

- b) Update on Banking Services Request for Proposals (RFP) Process – Treasurer’s Office

Mr. Brad Cromes, County Treasurer, provided an update on the banking services Request for Proposals (RFP) process. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Mr. Cromes, which he answered accordingly.

- c) Process for Community Commitment Recommendations for Banking Services Contract

Mr. Ford addressed the subcommittee regarding a process for community commitment recommendations for the banking services contract. Discussion ensued. Subcommittee members asked questions of Mr. Ford, which he answered accordingly.

7. MISCELLANEOUS BUSINESS

Ms. Stephens asked Mr. Ford to convene a virtual meeting of the working group within the next 2-3 weeks to discuss the subcommittee’s recommendations that will be presented to the administration; and thanked the members for their commitment and efforts to help work towards the goals of the subcommittee and announced that the meeting dates for 2024 will be scheduled soon.

8. ADJOURNMENT

With no further business to discuss, Chairwoman Stephens adjourned the meeting at 3:20 p.m., without objection.

2024 Cuyahoga County Banking Services Contract

Notes from CRAS working group shaded light green (1-22-24).

Overarching concerns expressed consistently by County Council's Reinvestment Advisory Subcommittee

- Goals for meeting needs of underserved communities must be quantifiable and measurable.
- Commitments should be contractually binding, not merely "good faith effort".
- The contract should provide for the consequences of not meeting performance objectives.

Financial penalty rather than expect termination of contract.
Check with Chair Stephens re overarching items 2 and 3.

What is it costing the county to enter into this contract? Paying for the lock box services, credit card services?
Would be helpful to know.
How much is this worth to the bank? How much leverage does the county have?

Proposed Metrics/Goals for bank performance to address priority needs

Priority #1: Increase and sustain homeownership for historically underserved communities and populations

A) Home purchase mortgage lending - underserved populations

Alternative to benchmarks based on each bank's prior performance:

Over the course of the contract, expectation that each participating bank is hitting the same baseline - X number of loans.

Banks: you go from where you are today, to meeting that expectation.

Or, a market share approach? Benchmarks based on their share of Deposits? Applications received? Loans originated?

Regardless - does each bank still have the same enterprise value from entering into a contract w/county?

Loans to Black home buyers county-wide

| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| | | | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 50 | 46 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| Huntington | 177 | 133 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| PNC | 35 | 38 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |
| US Bank | 25 | 36 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Loans to low and moderate income home buyers county-wide

| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| | | | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 105 | 46 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| Huntington | 353 | 133 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| PNC | 87 | 38 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |
| US Bank | 48 | 36 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Small dollar [\$50,000 and below] home purchase loans county-wide

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 105 | 46 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| Huntington | 353 | 133 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| PNC | 87 | 38 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |
| US Bank | 48 | 36 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Note: although home prices have increased, the median in the East Side of Cleveland is still just over \$50,000; small home purchase loans are needed in this most underserved region to take advantage of affordable prices, and to compete with cash-paying investors.

Small dollar [\$100,000 and below] home purchase loans county-wide

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | available Aug 2024 | | |
| Huntington | | | available Aug 2024 | | |
| PNC | | | available Aug 2024 | | |
| US Bank | | | available Aug 2024 | | |

Note: analysis of loans ≤ \$100K will be added to this year's report, but may not be available until the third week of January. The report of 2021 and 2022 numbers will inform the 2024 and 2025 target goals.

B) Home purchase mortgage lending - underserved regions of the county

Loans to home buyers in the City of Cleveland

Note: due to high interest rates in 2022, loan applications for home purchase down and loan output fell accordingly.

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 103 | 90 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| Huntington | 321 | 206 | available Aug 2024 | 300 | 350 |
| PNC | 63 | 61 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 150 |
| US Bank | 45 | 52 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 150 |

Loans to home buyers in the East Side of Cleveland

| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| | | | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 30 | 24 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |
| Huntington | 91 | 67 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| PNC | 19 | 24 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |
| US Bank | 13 | 16 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Loans to home buyers in the East Inner Suburbs

| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| | | | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 71 | 68 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| Huntington | 237 | 175 | available Aug 2024 | 250 | 300 |
| PNC | 47 | 49 | available Aug 2024 | 100 | 200 |
| US Bank | 25 | 39 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |

There is no public data on the items below; each bank should be asked to disclose what they did.

C) Down Payment Assistance

| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

D) Home Ownership Counseling

| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

E) Partnering with HUD to ensure borrower success and sustainability????

Need clarification - what does this mean?

| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| | | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

Priority #2: Increase Home Repair Loans

A) Home repair lending - underserved regions of the county

Loans for home repair in the City of Cleveland

Note: applications for home repair loans did not drop in 2022, and loan output for home repair did not drop in 2022.

Key Bank's home repair lending had been significantly higher in past years. The target goals would put them on track with their prior performance.

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 86 | 93 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| Huntington | 89 | 107 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| PNC | 15 | 23 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |
| US Bank | 10 | 22 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |

Loans for home repair in the East Side of Cleveland

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 31 | 33 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |
| Huntington | 21 | 36 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 150 |
| PNC | 5 | 8 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |
| US Bank | 2 | 0 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Loans for home repair in the East Inner Suburbs

| | | | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|------|------|--------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | 2021 | 2022 | 2023 | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | 79 | 82 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| Huntington | 84 | 97 | available Aug 2024 | 150 | 200 |
| PNC | 17 | 40 | available Aug 2024 | 75 | 100 |
| US Bank | 13 | 25 | available Aug 2024 | 50 | 100 |

Priority #3: Encourage lenders to be entrepreneurial with assistance to non-profits and small business

There is little or no public data on the items below; each bank should be asked to disclose what they did. Small business loans will be reported in the future; the first full year of reporting will be 2025.

A) Grants made

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

B) Physical assets donated

Needs more definition, what do we mean - REO taken back after foreclosure? Other buildings?

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

C) Loans forgiven

Needs more clarification - and is it realistic?

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

D) Small business loans made

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

E) Low income tax credits purchased

Baseline # of units expected to be supported?

Would this be better expressed as "Investments to increase affordable rental housing"?

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |

F) Investments to increase affordable housing

Baseline # of units expected to be supported?

Would this be better expressed as "Investments to increase affordable homeownership"?

| | | Target Goals | |
|--------------|--------------------------------|--------------|------|
| Partner Bank | Ask: What did they do in 2023? | 2024 | 2025 |
| Key Bank | | | |
| Huntington | | | |
| PNC | | | |
| US Bank | | | |